Non-Pharmacological Intervention to Improve Motivation among Patients with Schizophrenia: A scoping review

Nur Ain Zainal Kharib\(^1\),2, Akehsan Dahlan\(^2\), Syamsul Anwar Sultan Ibrahim\(^2\), Andriani Pratiwi\(^3\)

1 Unit Pemulihan Cara Kerja, Jabatan Rehabilitasi, Hospital Taiping, Jalan Taming Sari, 34000 Taiping, Perak, Malaysia,
2 Centre for Occupational Therapy Studies, Faculty of Health Sciences, Universiti Teknologi MARA (UiTM), Puncak Alam Campus, Selangor, Malaysia,
3 Rumah Sakit Universitas Indonesia (RSUI), Bahder Djohan, Pondok Cina, Kecamatan Beji, Kota Depok, Jawa Barat 16424, Indonesia

ainzk_otkkm@yahoo.com, akehsan@uitm.edu.my, syamsul2893@uitm.edu.my, andrianisukamto2509@gmail.com
Tel: 0199894091

Abstract

In recent years, recognition of motivational deficits in individuals with schizophrenia has grown, leading to increased exploration of non-pharmacological interventions in mental health. This review maps the literature on such treatments targeting motivational impairments in schizophrenia, aiming to identify gaps and suggest future research directions. The review identified 16 articles out of 80, predominantly randomized controlled trials. Various interventions, including cognitive training, behavioral programs, and mobile apps, have been identified to enhance motivation in this population. Despite limitations, the review provides a comprehensive overview and establishes a foundation for further research in enhancing motivation interventions for schizophrenia.

Keywords: intervention; treatment; motivation; schizophrenia

eISSN: 2398-4287 © 2024. The Authors. Published for AMER & e-Bs by e-International Publishing House, Ltd., UK. This is an open access article under the CC BY-NC-ND license (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/). Peer-review under responsibility of AMER (Association of Malaysian Environment-Behaviour Researchers), and e-Bs (Centre for Environment-Behaviour Studies), College of Built Environment, Universiti Teknologi MARA, Malaysia.
DOI: https://doi.org/10.21834/e-bpj.v9i28.5787

1.0 Introduction

Schizophrenia, a global mental illness affecting millions, presents challenges in Malaysia, with incidence rates ranging from 7.7 to 43.0 per 100,000 (Chee & Salina, 2014). It disrupts perceptions, thoughts, feelings, and behaviours (Nolen-Hoeksema, 2014), particularly manifesting in negative symptoms such as reduced goal-directed behaviour, social interactions and motivations (Aleman et al., 2017). Distinguishing between primary and secondary negative symptoms is therapeutically significant (Mucci et al., 2017). Comprehensive treatment for patients with schizophrenia involves pharmacological, rehabilitative, and social support interventions (Diez-Carral et al., 2015). This scoping review focuses on non-pharmacological interventions, recognizing their role in fostering recovery through meaningful activities (Höhl et al., 2017; Brown & Stoffel, 2019). It aims to explore non-pharmacological treatments targeting motivational impairments in schizophrenia, offering insights for future investigations and clinical strategies to enhance quality of life and treatment outcomes.

eISSN: 2398-4287 © 2024. The Authors. Published for AMER & e-Bs by e-International Publishing House, Ltd., UK. This is an open access article under the CC BY-NC-ND license (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/). Peer-review under responsibility of AMER (Association of Malaysian Environment-Behaviour Researchers), and e-Bs (Centre for Environment-Behaviour Studies), College of Built Environment, Universiti Teknologi MARA, Malaysia.
DOI: https://doi.org/10.21834/e-bpj.v9i28.5787
2.0 Literature review

Schizophrenia represents a severe mental illness characterized by profound disturbances in cognition, affect, and behaviour (Mihaljević-Pelš et al., 2019). Its pervasive impact extends beyond the individual, impairing the capacity to discern reality, constructing a distinct internal world, and estranging individuals from social interactions and environments (Jespersen, 2019). Moreover, the ripple effects of schizophrenia extend to familial dynamics, presenting challenges and disruptions for the affected individual’s family members (Kate, 2013). Drawing from The Diagnostic and Statistical Manual of Mental Disorders (5th ed.; DSM–5; American Psychiatric Association, 2013), the clinical presentation of schizophrenia is characterized by a spectrum of symptoms, including delusions, hallucinations, disorganized speech, grossly disorganized or catatonic behaviour, and negative symptoms such as diminished motivation and low self-esteem, all of which pose significant challenges for individuals diagnosed with the disorder.

Leweke et al. (2018) posit that dysregulation within the dopaminergic system may underlie the motivational deficits observed in schizophrenia, thereby exacerbating social impairments (Barch & Dowd, 2010). Research suggests that imbalances in neurotransmitters, particularly dopamine and glutamate, play a significant role in the pathophysiology of schizophrenia. (Barch & Dowd, 2010; Leweke et al., 2018). Dopamine dysregulation in specific brain regions, such as the mesolimbic pathway, is associated with symptoms like hallucinations and delusions. Dopamine also influences motivation and reward processing in the brain. Dysfunctions in dopamine signaling pathways may contribute to reduced motivation and pleasure in individuals with schizophrenia. The second reason patients with schizophrenia lack motivation is due to Brain Abnormalities (Heuvel & Fornito, 2014). Both Structural and Functional: Neuroimaging studies have identified both structural and functional abnormalities in the limbic system, striatum, and prefrontal cortex of patients with schizophrenia. It is believed that these anomalies are the cause of the emotional dysregulation, decreased motivation, and cognitive deficiencies seen in schizophrenia. Interactions between these brain regions may become disrupted, which could lead to problems integrating motivational signals and initiating and maintaining goal-directed behaviours.

Motivation, closely intertwined with self-esteem (SE) (Basco & Han, 2016), is pivotal for maintaining a satisfactory quality of life (QOL) (Morgades-Bamba et al., 2019). However, its attenuation in schizophrenia often precipitates a decline in self-esteem, further compromising overall well-being (Degnan et al., 2021). The dearth of motivation has been linked to diminished performance in essential activities of daily living (ADL) (Pluck & Lee, 2013), instrumental activities of daily living (IADL) (Ran et al., 2017), reduced social engagement (Jespersen, 2019), and limited participation in leisure pursuits (Cella et al., 2016), highlighting the multifaceted repercussions of motivational deficits in individuals grappling with schizophrenia.

3.0 Methods

In conducting this review, we adopted the scoping review framework proposed by Arksey and O’Malley (2006), which consists of five key stages: defining the research question, identifying relevant studies, selecting appropriate studies, extracting and cataloguing data, and synthesizing and reporting the findings (McKinstry et al., 2014). To ensure a thorough investigation of recent literature concerning motivation interventions in schizophrenia, systematic searches were conducted in December 2023 across prominent databases such as SCOPUS, Web of Science, and Science Direct. The search utilized the keywords “intervention OR treatment AND motivation AND schizophrenia”, specifically in the title and abstract sections of articles. Inclusion criteria were defined to encompass relevance to the topic, presence of specified keywords, publication between 2013 and 2023, English language, and full article availability.

Following the removal of duplicate entries, titles and abstracts were screened, followed by a detailed examination of the full texts. The selected articles provided crucial data regarding intervention specifics, study methodologies, participant demographics, and outcomes related to motivation, facilitating a comprehensive synthesis of motivation interventions in schizophrenia and reflecting the most current research in this domain.

3.1 Article selection process and selection criteria

Figure 1 illustrates the PRISMA diagram outlining the process utilized for paper selection. Studies were considered eligible if they investigated or discussed motivational interventions within the context of schizophrenia treatment. The screening of titles and abstracts of retrieved papers was conducted by one author (N.A.) to identify relevant literature. Subsequently, the same author meticulously reviewed full-text copies of retained papers and conducted searches within reference lists to identify any additional relevant literature. Additionally, two authors (A.D. and S.A.) independently assessed half of the full texts each. Any discrepancies regarding inclusion, quality, and relevance were resolved through comprehensive discussions involving all reviewers. Figure 1 shows the review process. The summary table for each included article is in Table 1.
Table 1. Non-Pharmacological Motivation Intervention

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Num</th>
<th>Author(s)/Year</th>
<th>Study design</th>
<th>Aim</th>
<th>Population/Country</th>
<th>Motivation Intervention/Description</th>
<th>Summary of findings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Mororó, et al., 2023</td>
<td>Mixed quantitative and qualitative research design</td>
<td>To identify factors that may enhance (facilitators) or decrease (barriers) engagement in activity.</td>
<td>Patients with schizophrenia / Brazil</td>
<td>Digital cognitive training Computerized cognitive training for attention bias modification (games, jigsaw puzzles, memory tasks)</td>
<td>Digital cognitive training helps identify factors that may enhance (facilitators) or decrease (barriers) engagement in activity.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Nguyen, et al., 2016</td>
<td>Development</td>
<td>To reduce the syndrome of a diminished capacity to experience.</td>
<td>Participants were healthcare professionals / Switzerland</td>
<td>The positive emotions program for schizophrenia (PEPS) It consists of 8 sessions that promote skill in the behavioural expression of emotions, savouring pleasant moments, anticipating pleasant moments and relaxation exercises. 1 hour for 8 group sessions</td>
<td>PEPS is a specific, short, easy-to-use, group-based intervention to improve pleasure and motivation in schizophrenia.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Schlosser, et al., 2018</td>
<td>Randomized controlled trial</td>
<td>To improve motivation and quality of life</td>
<td>Participants with schizophrenia / United States</td>
<td>PRIME, a Mobile App Intervention A mobile app intervention designed to target reward-processing impairments and enhance motivation. Three primary features of PRIME (from left to right): Goals (goal-setting), Community (Text-based motivational coaching), and Moments (social networking and community feed). 4 days/week 12 weeks</td>
<td>PRIME has the potential to be an effective mobile-based intervention for improving aspects of mood and motivation in young people with schizophrenia.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Thonon, 2020</td>
<td>Pre-post test</td>
<td>To investigate its effects on motivation and associated processes in a naturalistic setting and to explore the dynamics between the processes.</td>
<td>Participants with schizophrenia / France</td>
<td>Switch The switch program was delivered in individual sessions. Sessions were dedicated to building a therapeutic alliance and identifying personal resources, goals, and values Multisensory &quot;imagery&quot; was used to help to look forward into the future. 1 hour per week for the first 6 months 1 hour every fortnight between the 6th and ninth months One hour every three weeks between the 9th and 12th months. In total, 30 sessions</td>
<td>The intervention results in significant enhancements in motivational negative symptoms and functional outcomes, suggesting its meaningful impact.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Favrod, et al., 2019</td>
<td>A Randomized Controlled Clinical Trial</td>
<td>To improve pleasure and motivation in schizophrenia patients by targeting emotion regulation and cognitive</td>
<td>Participants diagnosed with schizophrenia / Switzerland</td>
<td>The positive emotions program for schizophrenia (PEPS) It consists of 8 sessions that promote skill in the behavioural expression of emotions, savouring pleasant</td>
<td>PEPS is an effective intervention to reduce anhedonia in schizophrenia.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
To review the current state of neuroimaging and behavioural research addressing components of motivational deficits in this complex and impairing syndrome.

6 Martin, et al., 2020

Review

To examine correlations among mindfulness, negative symptoms, and psychological constructs associated with negative symptoms and adaptive functioning, including motivation, emotion regulation, and dysfunctional attitudes

7 Tabak, et al., 2015

Randomized controlled trial

To test the feasibility and preliminary effectiveness of Mobile Enhancement of Motivation in Schizophrenia (MEMS).

8 Luther, et al., 2020

Randomized controlled trial

To examine associations between twice daily self-reports of social motivation and behaviour.

9 Mow., et al., 2022

Quantitative

To explore the effect of combining PE and CT towards patient motivations.

10 Choi, et al., 2020

Randomized controlled trial

To examine the feasibility and acceptability of CR remote interventions for motivation.

11 Shreya., et al., 2022

Review

To evaluate the effectiveness of lifestyle intervention and to assess the persistence of potential effects in a 24-month long-term follow-up.
14 Melike, et al., 2016 A case study To describe the achievement of treatment collaboration through motivational interviews (MI) in a patient with treatment-resistant schizophrenia Participants with schizophrenia / Turkey Motivational Interviewing Open questions, affirmations, reflective listening, and summary reflections (OARS) are the basic interaction techniques and skills that are used “early and often” in the motivational interviewing approach. The MI method can be used to ensure continued treatment effectiveness, to increase patient awareness about the disease and benefits of treatment, and to increase patients’ self-efficacy.

15 Favrod, et al., 2022 Quantitative to evaluate the efficacy of motivational interviewing (MI) in Participants with schizophrenia/ United States Motivational interviewing Open questions, affirmations, reflective listening, and summary reflections (OARS) are the basic interaction techniques and skills that are used “early and often” in the motivational interviewing approach. Fidelity to the MI intervention was high, and MI condition was associated with increases in perceived MI showed some promise and may be a worthwhile addition to more comprehensive, robust efforts.

16 Thanh, et al., 2023 Randomized controlled trial To investigate whether early task-specific intrinsic motivation and its domains (e.g., interest, perceived competence, and value) predicted treatment engagement within the context of intensive cognitive training and aerobic exercise interventions. Participants with first-episode schizophrenia / United States Cognitive training (CT) and aerobic exercise (AE) programs CT and AE have higher baseline scores of intrinsic motivations for cognitive.

4.0 Findings
The search found 80 articles on motivation intervention in schizophrenia, resulting in 75 after removing duplicates. Sixty-five studies met inclusion criteria during the abstract review, and 16 were included in this scoping review. Most studies were conducted in Western countries (n=15). Six were randomized controlled trials; one was pre-post, another a review, and one quantitative. The rest used mixed methods, clinical trials, development, exploration, or case studies.

4.1 Non-Pharmacological Treatments Targeting Motivational Impairments in Schizophrenia
Out of 80 studies reviewed, 16 have been included in this analysis. Among these 16 papers, 13 distinct types of motivational interventions were identified, which can be categorized into three main types: Psychological and Behavioural Interventions, PE and CT, and Interventions utilizing mobile and computer applications.

4.2 Psychological and Behavioural Interventions
Psychological and behavioural interventions have emerged as the predominant approach for addressing the needs of individuals with schizophrenia within community settings, as evidenced by seven studies (n=7) (Nguyen et al., 2016; Thonon et al., 2020; Favrod et al., 2019; Martin et al., 2020; Tabak et al., 2015; Melike et al., 2016; Favrod et al., 2022). These interventions signify a concerted effort to provide comprehensive support and therapeutic strategies tailored to the unique challenges faced by individuals grappling with schizophrenia within community contexts. The primary objectives across these studies varied, encompassing endeavours to alleviate the syndrome of diminished capacity to experience (Nguyen et al., 2016; Favrod et al., 2019), explore the impact of interventions on patient motivation (Thonon et al., 2020), evaluate the current landscape of neuroimaging and behavioural research pertaining to motivational deficits (Tabak et al., 2015), and investigate correlations among mindfulness, negative symptoms, and psychological constructs related to negative symptoms and adaptive functioning (Melike et al., 2016; Favrod et al., 2022).

The duration of these interventions predominantly spanned one hour per session (Nguyen et al., 2016; Favrod et al., 2019), typically comprising eight sessions. However, Thonon et al. (2020) introduced a lengthier program, conducted gradually over a period of twelve months, with sessions occurring weekly for the first six months and then continuing bi-weekly for the subsequent six months, totaling 30 sessions. On the other hand, Tabak et al. (2015) advocated for shorter daily interventions, ranging from fifteen to forty-five minutes, tailored to schizophrenia patients. Notably, specific durations were not explicitly specified in other studies (Martin et al., 2020; Melike et al., 2016; Favrod et al., 2022).

4.3 Physical (PE) and Cognitive Interventions (CT)
In the realm of PE and CT, five studies have been integrated, notably featuring contributions from Blanca et al. (2023), Choi et al. (2020), Thanh et al. (2023), Alice et al. (2020), and Shreya et al. (2022). Notably, these studies exclusively focus on patients with schizophrenia who are not hospitalized, shedding light on the effectiveness and applicability of such interventions within community-based settings. These investigations focus on evaluating the effectiveness of lifestyle interventions in motivating patients with schizophrenia (Blanca et
al., 2023; Choi et al., 2020; Thanh et al., 2023) and exploring the association between cognitive deficits and motivation (Alice et al., 2020; Shreya et al., 2022). The duration of these interventions varied from one to six months, typically comprising sessions held three times per week, each lasting between thirty minutes to one hour for every activity (Blanca et al., 2023; Choi et al., 2020; Thanh et al., 2023). However, the specific duration of the programs needed to be specified in two of the studies (Alice et al., 2020; Shreya et al., 2022).

4.4 Interventions using mobile and computer applications.

Within the scope of interventions targeting schizophrenia in community settings, four studies stand out (Mororó et al., 2023; Schlosser et al., 2018; Luthe et al., 2020; Mow et al., 2022), each spanning a duration of two to four months. While Mororó et al. (2023) centred their investigation on factors influencing motivation engagement, cognitive enhancements, and symptomatology, particularly related to poor insight, the remaining studies (Schlosser et al., 2018; Luthe et al., 2020; Mow et al., 2022) aimed directly at improving motivation, social motivation, and overall quality of life.

In Mororó et al.’s (2023) study, computer use constituted a pivotal component, with interventions incorporating interactive elements such as memory tasks and jigsaw puzzles. Conversely, the other studies relied on mobile applications tailored to patients, designed to address reward-processing impairments and bolster motivation (Schlosser et al., 2018; Luthe et al., 2020; Mow et al., 2022). Notably, all interventions were implemented on an individual basis, emphasizing personalized approaches to intervention delivery.

5.0 Discussion

This scoping review explores non-pharmacological treatments for motivational impairments in schizophrenia. We found 16 articles across databases and journals, categorizing interventions into psychological/behavioural for example, PEPS and behavioural interventions, physical/cognitive, for example, PE and CT exercise, and mobile/computer-based such as SWITCH and PRIME. These insights offer healthcare providers new strategies. All articles published within the last decade reflect the growing interest in non-pharmacological interventions for schizophrenia. While promising, studies may be limited by small samples and the need for more randomization. Still, positive results highlight the potential of these interventions in improving motivation in schizophrenia.

Furthermore, reviews have highlighted the effectiveness of motivation interventions in schizophrenia, emphasizing the significance of non-pharmacological approaches as adjuncts to conventional psychiatric treatments. Within the reviewed literature, Psychological and Behavioral interventions emerged as the most frequently described motivational intervention (Nguyen et al., 2016; Thonon et al., 2020; Favrod et al., 2019; Martin et al., 2020; Tabak et al., 2015; Melike et al., 2016; Favrod et al., 2022), followed by PE and CT (Blanca et al., 2023; Choi et al., 2020; Thanh et al., 2023; Alice et al., 2020; Shreya et al., 2022), and Interventions utilizing mobile and computer applications out (Mororó et al., 2023; Schlosser et al., 2018; Luthe et al., 2020; Mow et al., 2022). These findings underscore the multifaceted nature of motivational interventions and the importance of adopting comprehensive approaches tailored to individual patient needs.

Based on the synthesis of information on the characteristics of the interventions in the included articles, a ‘typical’ motivation intervention in schizophrenia may include intervention in community-based patients, with 2–3 weekly 60-minute sessions and a duration of between 2 and 12 months. However, none of the articles explained their choice of intervention characteristics, and all mentioned conducting interventions in overseas mental health centres, suggesting potential influence by centre regulations/policies. Regardless of the intervention type in each study, the articles included in this review demonstrated the positive effects of non-pharmacological motivation interventions. We underscore the implications of this review for the practice of Occupational Therapy (OT) and similar professionals. This scoping review equips healthcare providers with tools to develop motivational intervention sessions in schizophrenia by understanding the characteristics of these three types of interventions: Psychological and behavioural interventions, PE and CT, and Interventions utilizing mobile and computer applications. However, it is important to note that while non-pharmacological interventions identified in this review significantly improve motivation among persons with schizophrenia, the studies were predominantly conducted in Western countries, and none of the participants were hospitalized. Therefore, the applicability of these interventions to the Asian population, particularly in Malaysia, remains unexplored, highlighting the need for tailored programs for persons with schizophrenia in Malaysia.

6.0 Conclusion & Recommendations

This review acknowledges limitations such as incomplete data, publication and selection biases, and language restrictions to English studies. DSM 5 criteria were adopted due to search challenges. While article quality was not assessed, key limitations were discussed. Strengths include addressing literature gaps and outlining common non-pharmacological interventions. Gaps include fewer Asian intervention studies and methodological limitations. Extensively researched interventions involve Psychological/Behavioral, Physical, Cognitive, and mobile/computer applications. Sessions typically occur 2–3 times weekly over 2 to 12 months to improve patient quality of life. Further research is needed to define optimal parameters and long-term effects.

Acknowledgements

I extend my gratitude to my supervisors, colleague (Miss Nurani) and UiTM for their invaluable academic and professional assistance,
which facilitated the completion of this review.

Paper Contribution to Related Field of Study
This paper contributed to the field of health sciences and medicine, especially in the area of non-pharmacological intervention for persons with schizophrenia.

References


